

Dear Cardiff PSB member:

The following is a draft response to the inquiry outlined below.

Please could any comments be provided to naswain@cardiff.gov.uk copying in clive.bailey2@cardiff.gov.uk by **Friday 1 December 2017**.

Kind regards
Clive Bailey

Consultation on Local Approaches to poverty reduction: The Well-Being of Future Generations Act and public service boards

The Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee is undertaking an inquiry into Local Approaches to poverty reduction: The Well-Being of Future Generations Act and public service boards.

Terms of reference

The Committee's terms of reference for its inquiry are to:

- examine how public service boards (PSBs) are targeting improvements to public services in Wales's most deprived communities;
- assess the quality of evidence used by PSBs in the development of their local Well-Being Plans in relation to the needs and experiences of people living in poverty, including how PSBs are approaching the impending demise of Communities First;
- consider how PSBs are specifically addressing rural poverty as part of the development of their Well-Being plans
- explore and understand the experiences of organisations (public, private and third-sector) and individuals in the development of well-being plans and the potential impact of greater regional working in the future.

Invitation to contribute to the inquiry

The Committee is inviting PSBs to submit written evidence to assist in its consideration of the Act. The above terms of reference can be used to frame the response.

<http://www.senedd.assembly.wales/mgConsultationDisplay.aspx?id=281&RPID=1509491563&cp=yess>

Cardiff Public Services Board Response – National Assembly for Wales Consultation on Local Approaches to Poverty Reduction

Summary

1. Despite being the richest part of Wales, levels of deprivation in Cardiff are amongst the highest in the country. If the Southern Arc of Cardiff, from Ely in the West to Trowbridge in the East – an area of over 150,000 people - was considered a single local authority area it would be the most deprived in Wales by a considerable margin.
2. Across the city, levels of economic deprivation correlate closely with poor health, housing and educational outcomes. Cardiff's Public Services Board has therefore put inclusive growth- namely growth whose benefits are felt by all citizens - and addressing the causes and consequences of poverty at the heart of its local well-being plan.
3. To tackle entrenched disadvantage, health inequality and narrow the gap in life chances across the city, the PSB is pursuing a targeted, place-based approach to tackling poverty, aligned with the Welsh Government's reform of its anti-poverty programmes, Children First and Flexible Funding pilots.
4. The following report presents a commentary on the evidence that is being used to develop Cardiff's Draft Well-being Plan and then sets out the PSB's approach to tackling poverty through locality working.

Assessment of evidence used to develop Cardiff's Well-being Plan in relation to the needs and experiences of people living in poverty

Cardiff's Local Well-being Assessment

5. Cardiff's Well-being Plan has been developed based on the information collected through Cardiff's Local Well-being Assessment. The assessment provided a wide range of evidence relating to the needs and experiences of people living in poverty.
6. The [Liveable City Report \(LCR\)](#) which summarised the findings of the assessment, profiled the city in terms of levels of deprivation and drawing on the different experiences of Cardiff residents, highlighting the intra city gaps in outcomes across many aspects of city life.
7. Individual neighbourhood well-being assessments were also undertaken, enabling greater understanding of life in the more deprived areas of the city in comparison to the more affluent areas of Cardiff (as summarised on pages 16 and 17 of the LCR). The assessments drew heavily on responses to the [2016 Ask Cardiff Survey](#) which asked residents for their views on subjects such as health, safety, environment and the economy, providing an insight in to the quality of life across the city. The individual assessments can be found here: <https://www.cardiffpartnership.co.uk/well-being-assessment/>
8. Consultation on the well-being assessment not only invited views from city leaders and policy experts from across the public, third and private sectors and Cardiff's residents via an

online survey but recognising that the views of some groups (referred to as seldom heard groups) are not often captured, targeted focus groups and drop in sessions were held with:

- Cardiff Youth Council
- 150 young people from Willows High School
- A joint forum with Cardiff's Access Focus Group and 50+ forum
- Cardiff Council's internal BME Forum for council staff from ethnic minority backgrounds
- Cardiff Third Sector Council's BME Network for professionals from ethnic minority organisations.

The consultation report summarising the approach taken and feedback can be found [here](#).

9. The Cardiff Public Services Board undertook its Well-being assessment drawing on the following evidence base:

- The 46 National Indicators set out by Welsh Government under the Well-being of Future Generations Act;
- Indicators recommended by Public Services Board partners and other stakeholders;
- Cardiff's Ask Cardiff Survey 2016 seeking residents views on council services to help shape future service delivery. This survey received the second-largest response rate achieved (4,024 behind the 2015 survey which received 4,431 responses)
- Individual neighbourhood assessments highlighting the differences in levels of poverty across the city.
- Feedback from online consultation and events held with city leaders, policy experts from organisations across Cardiff and seldom heard groups
- The consultation results report can be found here
- Formal feedback from the following stakeholders
 - Future Generations Commissioner
 - Welsh Government
 - Welsh Government Equality and Prosperity Team
 - Arts Council for Wales
 - Natural Resources Wales
 - Cardiff Green Infrastructure Group
 - 50+ Forum
- The European Union Urban Audit and the National Survey for Wales;
- A number of statutory reviews and assessments.

All data used to produce the assessment can be found here: <https://www.cardiffpartnership.co.uk/wellbeing-assessment-evidence-base/>

10. In bringing together this evidence, data gaps were identified. The evidence base is therefore continuously being updated to capture data as it becomes available to further inform the development of the well-being plan. Data gaps included data relating to a number of the 46 national indicators set out under the Well-being of Future Generations Act and local data on Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACEs).

11. It is also recognised that there is a lack of evidence relating to levels of food insecurity, with national surveys only giving an indication of those experiencing severe food insecurity (3% across Wales), rather than a more complete picture. Food insecurity is likely to contribute to a range of issues including obesity, ACEs and educational outcomes. Steps are being taken with the first reading of a "household food insecurity measurement bill" in November 2017 and officers are having ongoing discussions with the Welsh Government's Food Division in relation to this. A UK inquiry has also been launched into childhood food insecurity which will seek evidence from a panel of children in each of the 4 devolved nations.

Consultation on Cardiff's Draft Well-being Plan

12. Feedback from a programme of engagement and consultation will also be used to further develop Cardiff's Well-being Plan. The programme includes an on-line survey (open 13 October 2017 - 5 January 2018), social media campaign, stakeholder workshops with seldom heard groups and locality events across the city.
13. These methods of engagement have been designed to capture the needs and experiences of people across Cardiff, including those living in the more deprived areas of the city. The focus of discussion will be on what matters to them and the locality in which they live.

Ask Cardiff Survey 2017

14. Cardiff's annual Ask Cardiff Survey, which seeks residents' views on council services to help shape future service delivery, will also inform the final local well-being plan. A series of questions on well-being were included in this year's survey. Most significantly, the survey analysis will for the first time categorise responses by deprivation level and this will help the PSB to build a more detailed picture of deprivation at the local level, informing the targeting of services. Over 6,000 responses were received to the survey.
15. Cardiff's Well-being assessment highlighted the following:
 - a. Over 60,000 people in Cardiff live in the 10% most deprived communities in Wales. If the 'Southern Arc' of Cardiff, from Ely in the West to Trowbridge in the East – an area of over 150,000 people - was considered a single local authority area it would be the most deprived in Wales by a considerable margin.
 - b. Patterns of deprivation have been consistent over the long term. An analysis of Welsh Index of Multiple Deprivation (WIMD) data from 2005 – 2014 shows little change.
 - c. Though jobs are being created in Cardiff - over 20,000 in the last 3 years alone – the city economy's productivity remains at pre-2008 levels. In particular, low wages are common, with 27% of residents in Cardiff earning less than the National Living Wage, a figure comparable to the most disadvantage areas of Wales. Similarly, levels of unemployment and ill health, which align closely with patterns of deprivation, are as high or higher in Cardiff than other parts of Wales.

- d. There is a clear correlation between areas with a young age profile and the level of deprivation. The areas of Cardiff that are considered the most deprived, tend to have the highest proportions of the population under the age of 15. This is particularly significant given the impact of poverty on the life chances of young people.
- e. There is also a clear correlation between deprivation and demand on public services (particularly services which deal with crises e.g. blue light services, A&E). Crime in Cardiff is concentrated in the more deprived areas in the south and east of Cardiff and in terms of obesity, a key cause of serious and long-term illness and demand on health services, nearly twice as many adults living in the more deprived areas of the city are reported as being overweight or obese.
16. Prior to the assessment, Cardiff's Single Integrated Plan and its needs assessments had told a similar story. However, it is clear from this assessment that the gap in outcomes across many aspects of city life are persistent and in some cases are continuing to grow:
- Gap in income between the richest 10% and poorest 10% is the largest of all Core Cities. Though this gap is primarily driven through relatively higher earnings of the top 10%, 27% of all workers are earning less than the National Living Wage.
 - Men living in the least deprived communities can expect to live on average 11 years longer than those who live in the most deprived areas, while the gap is 9 years for women.
 - Healthy life expectancy gap of 22 to 24 years between the richest and poorest communities and mortality from, for example, heart disease is seven times higher in Riverside than it is in Thornhill.
 - Perceptions of safety also vary significantly across the six neighbourhood areas, ranging from 77.8% of people in Cardiff West to just 65% in Cardiff East.
 - Educational outcomes across the city varies significantly. More than half (56.5%) of the areas in Cardiff East are ranked in the 10% most deprived in Wales, while this is only true for 3.4% of the areas in Cardiff North. The gap between those pupils who receive free school meals (FSM) and those that do not remains substantial.
 - The majority of school leavers who do not make a successful transition to further education, training or employment, live in the more deprived areas of the city. At the end of August 2015, the proportion of young people aged 16-18 who were not engaged in training ranged from 2.6% in Cardiff North to 5.9% in Cardiff South West.
 - Greenspaces are not always located near to the people that would benefit from them most. The areas with the least access to greenspaces coincide with some of the areas which have the highest rates of all types of crime as well as poorer health outcomes.

Cardiff PSB's approach to targeting improvements to public services in Wales's most deprived communities

Cardiff's Local Well-being plan

17. In response to the persistent and growing levels of inequality highlighted in the assessment, Cardiff's PSB has put inclusive growth - namely growth whose benefits are felt by all citizens - and addressing the causes and consequences of poverty at the heart of its local well-being plan. Cardiff's draft Local Well-being Plan can be found [here](#).

Targeted approaches to tackling poverty - Locality Working

18. To tackle entrenched disadvantage, health inequality and narrow the gap in life chances across the city, a new approach to locality working is to be adopted, where resources are increasingly targeted at areas of deprivation and high demand and where integration of public and third sector services are not only pursued at the local but hyperlocal level.
19. This place-based approach was piloted for service integration for older people in Llanishen with the aim of providing locally based home care. The following questions were asked:
- What Assets do we have in the Area?
 - What Services are currently being provided?
 - What Community Resources currently exist?
 - What are the needs of individuals?
 - What are their preferences?
20. It was found that with many providers and services serving the area there was a need to look at opportunities to streamline and improve coordination of the provision on offer with a "perfect locality" solution being one care provider alongside a full range of joined up support services.
21. To take the approach forward, the PSB commissioned research to profile the Ely/Caerau wards of Cardiff, two of the most deprived areas in Wales. This research showed that levels of relative deprivation have remained consistent for a generation, that there was a correlation between poor economic outcomes and poor health and educational outcomes, and that there was a high level of demand across a range of reactive public services compared to the city-average.
22. However, the study identified that there are significant public and third sector assets and services in the community, and a number of opportunities in the form of future investments e.g. a new build high school, 6000 new homes are being built in the adjacent ward.
23. Given that the study area which has both the youngest and poorest populations in the city is about to benefit from the opportunity of a new build high school, it was agreed to adopt the Children's First 'place-based' approach in the area. The Children First approach is about initiating change at the local level, based on the needs of the specific place as identified by listening to children and young people and to the local community.

24. Allied to this, the area is a recipient of targeted Welsh Government anti-poverty programmes including Communities First, Families First and Flying Start. The reform of the Welsh Government's flagship anti-poverty programmes will provide an opportunity to remove unnecessary barriers and reimagine these programmes in a coordinated and cohesive way, with the flexibility to respond to individual families and communities strengths and challenges.
25. The PSB therefore welcomes Cardiff being chosen as a Full Flexible Funding Pathfinder, providing 100% flexibility across grants in order to achieve increased programme alignment, make more effective use of funding and meet local needs.
26. Progressing Welsh Government's Building Resilience Programme that will replace Communities First will also play an essential part in developing locality working. Following a review of employability services, which included mapping provision across the city, a new integrated and Council led approach to employment services has been developed. Central to the approach is the creation of a single Gateway directing individuals to the Employment Services available in their local area.
27. As a next step, it is intended that a full review is undertaken to develop all three strands of the Building Resilience Programme (Employment, Early Years and Empowerment). This will identify the services already available across the city, how people access these services and if there are any gaps or duplication. The potential opportunity for joint commissioning with other partners will also be explored. A way forward will then be developed including proposals on the following:
- How to provide pathways to Community Learning
 - Commissioning a Health and Wellbeing Support Service across the City
 - A new approach to Community Involvement and Engagement

Measuring progress

28. To measure progress against each of the well-being objectives, the draft well-being plan includes city level performance indicators. A group led by Public Health has been convened to ensure these indicators also capture progress in narrowing the gap in outcomes between communities and groups in the city.